

Research Day at the Institute of Musical Research

Music in the Psychoanalytic Ear: Thinking, Listening and Playing

The Court Room

Senate House Library, London (WC1E 7HU)

Saturday 19th May 2018

This study day is generously supported by the Institute for Musical Research in association with the School of Advanced Studies, the ResearchWorks Programme at the Guildhall School of Music & Drama, and the Department of Psychology at the University of Roehampton.

**GUILD
SCHOOL
HALL**



Music in the Psychoanalytic Ear: Thinking, Listening and Playing

A number of scholars in music studies have recently drawn on psychoanalytic ideas to make sense of musical experiences and meaning. At the same time, there are long-established links between music therapy and psychoanalysis; a large number of psychoanalysts, analytic psychotherapists and others working in this ‘talking’ tradition have themselves considered what music might mean in light of their clinical practice. However, despite influencing one another, these disciplines tend to operate independently, with practitioners of each rarely directly engaging those across the disciplinary divides. Musicologists, music therapists, and psychoanalysts have talked about music, *but rarely do they speak to one another* about music. This IMR research day addresses the need for interdisciplinary dialogue by asking: what can we learn about music when these disciplines begin to speak and listen to one another?

Rachel Darnley-Smith
University of Roehampton

Samuel Wilson
Guildhall School of Music and Drama &
London Contemporary Dance School

Conference schedule

9:00–9:30 – Registration

9:30–9:40 – Opening welcome

Panel 1 – 9:40-11:10 – Communities and Identities:

Chair: Helen Odell-Miller

Psychoanalysis beyond the Spoken Word: Musical Attachments in Therapeutic Communities

Kate Brown
Psychoanalytic Psychotherapist

Using Lacan, Listening to the Tragically Hip: Pop Music, National Identity and *Objet a*

Alexander Carpenter
Musicologist, University of Alberta

Two Kinds of Music Therapy

Luke Annesley
Music Therapist

11:10–11:40 – Break (*refreshments provided*)

Panel 2 – 11:40–13:10 – Technique and Method(s):

Chair: Samuel Wilson

Synchronicity, Music in the Mind and Psychological Transformation

Catherine O'Leary
Music Therapist

Music, Temporality and Consciousness: Towards a Lacanian Understanding of Music as a Self-Reverting Act

Rebecca Day
Musicologist, Royal Holloway

'It's Music to my Psychoanalytic Ears': Building Bridges Between Psychoanalysis and Music

Anastasios Gaitanidis
Psychoanalytic Psychotherapist, University of Rochampton

13:10–14:10 Break for lunch (*own arrangements*)

Panel 3 – 14:10–15:40 – Sound, Listening, and Performance:

Chair: Christopher Tarrant

Psychoanalytically Informed Performance

Max Wong

Violinist and Musicologist, Royal College of Music

Music as a Modality for Dream-Work in Improvisation Based Music Psychotherapy and in Guided Imagery and Music (GIM)

Martin Lawes

Music Therapist

Queer Resonances: Disoriented Listening Through Kristeva and Anzieu

Steven Moon

Ethnomusicologist, University of Pittsburgh

15:40–16:00 Break (refreshments provided)

Roundtable: “What are we listening to? What do we hear?”– 16:00–17:30

Chair: Rachel Darnley-Smith

Invited speakers:

Rosemary Rizq

Psychoanalytic Psychotherapist, Chartered Psychologist and
Principal Lecturer at University of Roehampton

Ann Sloboda,

Head of Music Therapy at Guildhall School of Music and Drama,
and Psychoanalyst

Kenneth Smith

Musicologist/Music Analyst, University of Liverpool

Paper abstracts

Panel 1 – 9:40-11:10 – Communities and Identities:

Psychoanalysis beyond the Spoken Word: Musical Attachments in Therapeutic Communities

Kate Brown

Psychoanalytic Psychotherapist

Psychoanalysis, in particular relational psychoanalysis, has long been interested in the musicality of the interaction between patient and analyst. Many authors (Stern, 1985; Bebe, 2014) have turned its attention to the exquisite non-verbal dance and interaction between mother and baby and discusses themes of embodiment and attunement. This paper explores the unacknowledged role of music specifically in the context of therapeutic communities treating those who have experienced trauma and mental illness. Examples of how listening, playing and performing music has helped within therapeutic communities are offered and situated within the theoretical framework of attachment theory and contemporary trauma theory.

Music is demonstrated to be useful in the context of proximity seeking, managing separation distress, achieving a safe haven and a secure base, and musicality emerges as a fundamental aspect of our connection to others. Trauma Theorist, Judith Herman (1992) in her ground-breaking work 'Trauma and Recovery' argues that reconnection with one's community is integral to recovery from trauma. Examples of how music has helped re-build connections within therapeutic communities in the aftermath of trauma are used to illustrate music's place within psychoanalysis and beyond the spoken word. The paper is intended to be of interdisciplinary appeal demonstrating to musicians and musicologists a theoretical framework with which to understand musicality with those who have experienced trauma, and to psychoanalysts and psychotherapists interested in musical creativity at the borders of the spoken and verbal and expanding ideas of music's role in the possibilities of treatment.

Using Lacan, Listening to the Tragically Hip: Pop Music, National Identity and *Objet a*

Alexander Carpenter

Musicologist, University of Alberta

The recent and well-publicized illness and subsequent death of Gord Downie, lead singer of the Canadian rock band The Tragically Hip, has reopened the issue of national identity in the popular discourse in Canada, especially as it is expressed through music. For many years, the 'The Hip' has been characterized by fans and the mainstream media as 'Canada's band,' in spite of the absence of stable signifiers of Canadian-ness in the band's music. What, then, explains the desire of fans and the media to hear The Tragically Hip as intrinsically Canadian? I argue in this paper that one way to understand this desire is through Lacan's concept of the *objet a*, the object-cause of desire.

Building upon Slavoj Žižek's treatment of the shark in the film *Jaws* as a polysemous symbol used to explicate Lacan's *objet a*, or the empty signifier, I examine The Tragically Hip and its music as an empty signifier, as that which marks the place where the elusive desired object—national identity, in this case—is thought to be. The band, while understood as somehow specially 'Canadian,' is a really substitute for the absent and the unnameable; and The Hip—a band that, incidentally, uses the symbology of *Jaws* both sartorially and in song lyrics—is really, like the killer shark, a locus for a broad range of interpretations and anxieties about Canadian identity.

Two Kinds of Music Therapy

Luke Annesley
Music Therapist

Music is often divided into genres. Whether looking up music online, or browsing in a record shop, we are confronted with categories such as 'jazz', 'classical', 'rock', 'hip-hop', '60s soul', 'electronica', 'alternative'; the list goes on. Famously the jazz musician/band leader/composer Duke Ellington has the following quote attributed to him, 'There are two kinds of music. Good music, and the other kind.' He also said, (referring to race relations in the US), 'I don't believe in categories of any kind.' The idea that categories get in the way of music, stunting rather than facilitating its development, is perhaps pervasive amongst musicians themselves, particularly in evolving art forms such as jazz, while genre and category tend to be convenient tools for the music industry to identify markets and play to consumers' desires for 'more of the same', or to 'know what they are getting'.

Music therapy, despite being a tiny profession, encompasses a surprisingly wide variety of what might be called 'approaches', and may even be called 'brands'. In the UK, there is a long-standing perceived division between 'psychodynamic music therapy' and 'music-centred music therapy'. Other approaches have also developed, such as 'music psychotherapy', 'analytic music therapy', neurologic music therapy', 'behavioural music therapy', 'vocal psychotherapy' and 'guided imagery in music', while descriptors such as 'improvisational music therapy' and 'receptive music therapy' are sometimes used to identify specific interventions. Within the profession, the discussions continue about what the best approach might be for a particular client group, and sometimes about whether one approach might, in general, be 'better' than another. Misunderstandings and misinterpretations can arise, which can exacerbate divisions and lead to resentments and rivalries. Meanwhile, where are the clients?

In Aigen's (2014) recent chapter on 'The Client-Therapist Relationship in Music Therapy', he identifies some of these differences and advocates for an inclusive approach, where different therapeutic stances can happily co-exist. In this presentation I will take Aigen's chapter as a starting point from which to examine some of my own clinical practice. This will be a personal perspective rooted in clinical work, in which, with the use of case vignettes, I will explore how confining myself to 'one approach' might risk failing the client. I will examine how something like 'genre' can creep into clinical practice, and, where this does occur, what clinicians might do to break free of it, and keep the client at the centre of the work.

Panel 2 – 11:40–13:10 – Technique and method(s):

Synchronicity, Music in the Mind and Psychological Transformation

Catherine O'Leary
Music Therapist

A number of Carl Gustav Jung's theories are frequently used to inform our work as music therapists but the Theory of Synchronicity is not generally among them. For this presentation I will focus on Jung's theory of Synchronicity and theories concerning music in the mind and ear worms.

Jung describes his theory of Synchronicity as 'the simultaneous occurrence of a certain psychic state with one or more external events which appear as meaningful parallels to the momentary subjective state' (CW8: 850). The role of music in the mind as the link between the subjective psychic state and the external reality in synchronistic experiences will be discussed with examples given.

Among those who theorise about music in the mind Anthony Storr reflected on the music that ran in his head 'involuntarily' whenever his attention was not fully engaged (Storr, 1993, p. 125). His belief is that music plays a special role in aiding 'the scanning and sorting process' which goes on when we are asleep or day-dreaming' (p. 106). Herbert found the same result in her study of peoples' music-listening habits. It is music's '...capacity to affect shifts of consciousness that support an individual's sense of daily psychological balance' (Herbert, 2011, p. 306).

I suggest that occurrences of music in the mind related to synchronistic experiences are evidence of psychic transformation. Consequently it is important that the therapist is attentive to their occurrence in order to maximise the therapeutic benefit.

Music, Temporality and Consciousness: Towards a Lacanian Understanding of Music as a Self-Reverting Act

Rebecca Day
Musicologist, Royal Holloway

Music is often described as the most subjective of the arts. For Hegel, music's own 'proper element is the inner life' (Hegel, 1975, p. 626), for Taylor, it best represents the 'inner movements of our consciousness' (Taylor, 2016, p. 80), and according to Langer, it 'moulds, models, and makes audible the flow of our inner subjective life, the pattern or logical form of sentience' (Langer, 1953, p. 27). Questions of temporality are subsequently central to these ideas – as Taylor identifies, 'music seems the perfect medium for reflecting the temporal flux of life and yet being able to simultaneously stand outside of it' (2016, p. 100). Yet, the interdisciplinary implications of these claims are often avoided in analytical terms; not only are the boundaries of this 'subjectivity' unclear, but the ways in which music engages with them are undertheorized.

This paper claims that the critical application of Lacanian ideas of subjectivity could provide a means to understanding music's role in the re-presentation of consciousness. Temporality is imbricated in the symbolic process central to the Lacanian formation of the subject, which is a self-reverting act formed only through the interaction with an 'Other'. This paper will trace the ways in which this 'act' also unfolds in our understanding of the most basic musical processes, to argue that music does not only *represent* our inner-life, but that it is equivalent to the processes which are foundational to it.

'It's Music to my Psychoanalytic Ears': Building Bridges Between Psychoanalysis and Music

Anastasios Gaitanidis

Psychoanalytic Psychotherapist, University of Roehampton

I will begin my presentation by briefly describing the troubled relationship between psychoanalysis and music, which originates in Freud's explicit prioritisation of the verbal and visual over the auditory in his seminal work *The Interpretation of Dreams*, in his distinction between 'thing' and 'word presentations', and in his analysis of art that seems to exclude any references to music. I will then try to ameliorate the split between these two disciplines/fields and build certain bridges by exploring Julia Kristeva's notions of 'chora' and the 'semiotic' which place the 'musicality' of language, its rhythm and tonality, pitch and timbre at the centre of the analyst's attention, Thomas Ogden's emphasis in his paper 'The Music of What Happens' on how both poetry/music and certain analytic sessions seem to generate powerful resonances and cacophonies of sound and meaning, and Andre Green's attempts to find ways of presenting affective content without resorting to the usual psychoanalytic conceptual, verbal and visual representations. Finally, I will finish my presentation with an analysis of Lori Anderson's recent poetic/musical art works which offer an innovative way of bringing together the various visual, verbal, affective and musical elements of art and psychoanalysis.

Panel 3 – 14:10–15:40 – Sound, listening, and performance:

Psychoanalytically Informed Performance

Max Wong

Violinist and Musicologist, Royal College of Music

The availability of historical sources on performance practice in the early twentieth century gave rise to historically informed performance. However, the discovery of psychoanalysis at a similar time has not similarly led to new possibilities of performance.

The mutual influence between psychoanalysis and musical praxis is uniquely a two-way street. First, understanding of compositional processes can lead us to increased psychoanalytic understanding of the composer beyond biographical documents. Second, psychoanalytic insight into the composer can provide the performer with new musical insight as to the interpretation of music.

A remarkable opportunity to explore this approach is offered by J. S. Bach's *Six Sonatas and Partitas* for Solo Violin, 1720 (hereafter the 'Solos'). This was also the year that Bach found his beloved wife,

Maria Barbara, unexpectedly dead and already buried upon his return home from business travels, noted as 'doubtless the most tragic event in Bach's entire life' (Wolff, 2002, p. 211). The implied importance of this marriage raises the possibility that Maria Barbara was the object of some sort of transference of motherly feelings, left bereft when Bach lost his mother at nine years old.

Analysing the Solos through methods from Laurence Dreyfus's work on Bachian inventions and Richard Chessick's psychoanalytic study of Wagner's *Tristan and Isolde*, this paper considers the possibility of such psychoanalytic insights from the Solos. The paper then considers how that might influence the interpretation of the Solos from a performance perspective, with demonstrations on the violin of very short extracts.

Music as a Modality for Dream-Work in Improvisation Based Music Psychotherapy and in Guided Imagery and Music (GIM)

Martin Lawes
Music Therapist

In this presentation, I will discuss music as a modality for dream-work in two different types of music psychotherapy: first, in improvisation-based work where the therapist creates the music with the client; and, secondly, in Guided Imagery and Music (GIM) where the client images spontaneously whilst listening to a sequence of pre-recorded music in an altered state of consciousness, with the therapist providing non-directive verbal support. I will draw on Ogden's work where he proposes psychoanalysis to involve the analyst's participating with the client in dreaming the emotional experiences the client has not been able to successfully dream alone. In both forms of music psychotherapy, it is the music that helps the client dream himself more fully into being in the sense Ogden describes. In improvisation-based work this involves the therapist 'dreaming in music' with the client. In GIM, it involves the client unconsciously creating the experience of the music he needs so as to dream himself more into being, the music acting as intersubjective participant in his process along with the therapist. I will provide clinical illustrations of the process in both forms of work and consider the unique nature and potential of music as dream-form. To conclude, I will propose 'dreaming in music' to be a form of thinking. I will reflect on the privileging of word-based thinking and consider how this has affected the way psychoanalysis has been used to inform the theory and practice of music therapy.

Queer Resonances: Disoriented Listening Through Kristeva and Anzieu

Steven Moon
Ethnomusicologist, University of Pittsburgh

This paper examines contemporary paradigms of listening and sound through psychoanalysis in order to interrogate how listening and sound are constructed as heterosexist processes of the body. By questioning how we are oriented towards or away from the sounds we produce and hear, conceptualizations of sound-as-penetration are weakened and allow for differently-oriented models of listening to unfold. Thinking queer vocality through Julia Kristeva's formulation of the abject, for instance, unsettles notions of the normative listening subject as feminized, and the sounding subject as phallic, and allows a reformulation of the body-sound axis. However, the abject requires additional

theorization in order to escape the normative/queer, masculine/feminine, and active/passive binaries that exist in discourse on both listening and psychoanalysis. Didier Anzieu's notion of the sonorous envelope assists in exploring non-penetrative modes of listening and erotics alike, disorienting gendered binaries and allowing for new epistemologies of listening to emerge that might be better reconciled with current trends in music studies such as affect theory, queer/trans studies, and tactile modes of listening. Psychoanalytic contributions to phenomenologies of sound are paramount to the advancement of sound studies methodologies, but as this paper demonstrates, require rethinking through specifically gendered dis/orientations of the body.

Paper presenters' biographies

LUKE ANNESLEY works for Oxleas NHS Foundation Trust Music Therapy Service, with children and young people. He is a trustee of the British Association of Music Therapy (BAMT) and the producer of the BAMT podcast, 'Music Therapy Conversations', as well as a visiting lecturer at GSMD and a music therapy blogger at <http://jazztoad.blogspot.co.uk>. He is currently studying for a master's degree in clinical research at City, University of London, funded by the NIHR. He is also a jazz saxophone player.

KATE BROWN is a Bowlby Centre trained UKCP registered Attachment based psychoanalytic psychotherapist who started her career in therapeutic communities working with adults with a variety of mental health difficulties, and with adolescents individually and in groups. Kate is in private practice in Bournemouth. Her website can be found at <http://talktherapy.net>

ALEXANDER CARPENTER is a musicologist and music critic. At present, he is an Associate Professor of Music and Chair of the Department of Fine Arts and Humanities at the Augustana campus of the University of Alberta. His research interests include the music of Arnold Schoenberg and the Second Viennese School, fin-de-siècle Vienna, popular music, and the connections between music and psychoanalysis.

REBECCA DAY is a PhD candidate in musicology at Royal Holloway, University of London, where she holds an AHRC Techné Associate scholarship. Her thesis focusses on conceptions of subjectivity in Mahler's musical modernism and she has wider interests in the intersections between critical theory and music analysis. Her recent publications include a Lacanian critique of postmodern music analysis in the *International Journal of Žižek Studies*.

ANASTASIOS GAITANIDIS is a member of the Research Centre for Therapeutic Education (RCTE) at the University of Roehampton, London, UK. He is also a Writer and Psychoanalytic Psychotherapist in private practice. He has published several articles on psychoanalysis and psychotherapy in peer-reviewed journals and he is the Editor of two books: *Narcissism – A Critical Reader* (2007) and *The Male in Analysis – Psychoanalytic and Cultural Perspectives* (2011). He enjoys singing Opera in his spare time and is also in the process of finishing his first novel.

MARTIN LAWES has been a music therapist for almost 20 years and is published in 4 peer-reviewed journals. His clinical experience is in special needs education, adult mental health and palliative care.

Martin is also a practitioner and trainer in Guided Imagery and Music (GIM) and founder of the Integrative GIM Training Programme offering training in London (www.integrativegim.org). He is the current chair of the European Association of Music and Imagery (EAMI) Training and Education Committee.

CATHERINE O'LEARY worked as a music therapist in the UK, the US and Ireland before beginning her study of Guided Imagery and Music in 1989, graduating in 1995. Analytical psychology was an interest from very early on. She had an analysis herself (1988-1992) and in 2013 she completed an MA in Jungian and Post-Jungian Studies at the University of Essex. Catherine is an assistant trainer on Martin Lawes' Integrative GIM Training and works privately in Cork, Ireland.

STEVEN MOON is an ethnomusicologist whose work focuses broadly on the relationship between sound and science. Currently, his work traces a genealogy of sonic-scientific inquiry from medieval Islamist thought to contemporary technologies and experiments of the senses. He has presented at regional and national meetings of SEM and AMS on popular music, critical race theory, and queer theory, and has received Fellowships from the US Department of Education and Department of State. An article on Azerbaijan, cell phones, and listening is forthcoming in *Etnomüzikoloji Dergisi*, the journal of the Association of Ethnomusicology in Turkey.

MAX WONG is a doctoral student at the Royal College of Music, studying performance practice issues in J. S. Bach's *Six Sonatas and Partitas* for Solo Violin. He is a Fellow of the Royal Schools of Music and has performed concertos with orchestras in the US, UK and China. Max obtained his Bachelor's in Philosophy from Harvard and his Master's in Physics and Philosophy from Columbia. He is a qualified but non-practising English solicitor.

Invited speakers' biographies

ROSEMARY RIZQ is a UKCP-registered psychoanalytic psychotherapist, a senior practitioner member of the British Psychological Society's Register of Psychologists Specialising in Psychotherapy and a Chartered Counselling Psychologist registered with the Health and Care Professions Council. She is Principal Lecturer in Counselling Psychology at University of Roehampton. She worked for many years in an NHS Primary Care service in London and until recently was Adult Psychotherapist at Forest House Psychotherapy Clinic. She has a part-time private practice in West London. Rosemary is interested in the unconscious organisational dynamics in the NHS, and has published widely on the impact of government changes to mental health services. She is also interested in the relationship between literature and psychoanalysis.

ANN SLOBODA is Head of Music Therapy at the Guildhall School of Music & Drama. She is a qualified psychoanalyst and a member of the British Psychoanalytical Society and is registered with the BCP (British Psychoanalytic Council) and the HCPC (Health Care Professions Council). She studied music at Worcester College, Oxford. She qualified as a music therapist in 1985 at the Guildhall School of Music & Drama, where she subsequently taught as Clinical Tutor. Between 1985 and 2005 she worked as a music therapist in the NHS, in the fields of adult learning disability, eating disorders, general psychiatry and forensic psychiatry. A past chair of the Association of Professional Music Therapists, she was Head of Arts Therapies at West London Mental Health Trust for 10 years. Here, she established and developed clinical services in art, drama and music therapy. She provides consultations to music therapists working in the health, voluntary, and education sectors.

KENNETH SMITH is Senior Lecturer in Music at the University of Liverpool. His first book, *Skryabin, Philosophy and the Music of Desire* (RMA Monographs, Ashgate) was published in 2013. His next book, *Desire in Chromatic Harmony: A Psychodynamic Exploration of Fin de Siècle Tonality* (Oxford Studies in Music Theory, OUP), will appear next year, and will be a psychoanalytical and music-theoretical study of works by post-Wagnerian composers such as Strauss, Szymanowski, Skryabin, Ives and Suk.